

## **PILOTAGE ADVISORY COMMITTEE MINUTES OF MEETING**

Date : 14 January 2019 (Monday)  
Place : Conference Room A, 24/F, Harbour Building  
Time : 2:30 p.m.

### **Present**

Chairman:	S F Wong	Deputy Director, Marine Department (“MD”)
Members:	Capt Lam Ming-fung, Lothair	Hong Kong Shipowner Association
	Ma Kam-fai, Henry	Hong Kong Liner Shipping Association (“HKLSA”)
	Chan Kam-foo	Shipping Agencies
	Ning Fuk-kei, Franco	Containers Terminal Operators
	Ms Lu Zheng, Caroline	Dry Bulk Cargo Terminal Operators
	Yim Kong, Erik	Break Bulk Cargo Operators
	Chu Wai-leung	Oil Terminal Operators
	Zhong Ying	Dockyard Industry
	Chow Shiu-bong, Cliff	Tug Operators
	Capt Chan Kam-wing	Master Mariner
	Capt Tsang Cheuk-yin, Joe	Master Mariner
	Capt Wang Chi-cheong	Licensed Pilot
	Capt Lam Wai-ming, Steven	Licensed Pilot
	C T Lai	Assistant Director / Port Control (“AD/PC”), MD
	W H Wong	General Manager / Vessel Traffic Services (“GM/VTS”), MD
	Y W Lee	Surveyor of Ships (Nautical) Examiner (1), MD
Secretary:	Anson MC Sinn	Executive Officer (General & Committee), MD

**In attendance (except for item II)**

Huang Jihe

Senior Marine Officer / Vessel  
Traffic Centre, MD

George Tang

Marine Manager / Pilotage, MD

Bruce Lee

Hong Kong Pilots Association  
("HKPA")

**Absent with apologies**

Capt Zhou Wei

Master Mariner

**I. Opening Remarks**

Action

1. The Chairman extended his welcome to all the members. He informed the meeting that the following 14 persons have been appointed / re-appointed *ad personam* as non-official members of the Pilotage Advisory Committee (“PAC”) for two years from 1 January 2019 to 31 December 2020. A Gazette Notice was published on 28 December 2018, namely –

***Appointment***

Chan Kam-foo

(representing the interests of the shipping agencies)

Zhong Ying

(representing the interests of the dockyard industry)

Capt Wang Chi-cheong (licensed pilot)

Capt Lam Wai-ming, Steven (licensed pilot)

***Re-appointment***

Capt Lam Ming-fung, Lothair

(representing the interests of the Hong Kong Shipowners Association)

Ma Kam-fai, Henry

(representing the interests of the Hong Kong Liner Shipping Association)

Ning Fuk-kei, Franco

(representing the interests of the container terminal operators)

Ms Lu Zheng, Caroline

(representing the interests of the dry bulk cargo terminal operators)

Yim Kong, Erik

(representing the interests of the break bulk cargo operators)

Chu Wai-leung

(representing the interests of the oil terminal operators)

Chow Shiu-bong, Cliff

(representing the interests of the tug operators)

Capt Zhou Wei (master mariner)

Capt Chan Kam-wing (master mariner)

Capt Tsang Cheuk-yin, Joe (master mariner)

2. The Chairman apprised the meeting of the house rules of PAC:
  - (a) All participants are requested to turn their mobile phones to silent mode.
  - (b) The Secretariat will not make written records of the oral comments made by attendees in attendance at the meetings.
  - (c) Attendees in attendance will not have the right to vote if and when there is a question coming or arising before a PAC meeting.
  - (d) Attendees in attendance should withdraw from the session “Interview of pilot apprentices-to-be” since the statute only confers the right upon the Committee to interview the applicant. ***Post-meeting note:*** vide Regulation 2(2) of the Pilotage Regulations (Cap. 84A).
  - (e) If the discussion items involve restricted or confidential documents, pursuant to the “need-to-know” principle, the Chairman can ask observers to withdraw from the meeting. The paper concerned and the discussion will be restricted to the staff members of MD and the members of PAC.

3. The Chairman informed members that PAC had all along adopted a two-tier reporting system of declaration of interests where members (including the Chairman, official and non-official members) would be required to register their personal interests upon their first appointment and at meetings when situations of conflict of interest arise. He appealed to those who had yet to fill in the declaration form to submit it to the Secretariat as soon as practicable.

***Post-meeting note:*** On 28 February 2019, all declaration forms were received by the Secretariat.

## **II. Interview of pilot apprentices-to-be**

4. The Chairman said that PAC would interview two candidates in sequence (namely Cheng Ho-yin and Chow Ho-yin) to test their suitability for being apprentice pilots.
5. All the Members (including the Chairman) of PAC declared no actual/ perceived / potential conflict of interest.

6. The two candidates were asked to brief PAC on their maritime study and sea-time experience. Both candidates were asked about the differences between the characteristics and manoeuvrability of bulk carriers and container vessels, their experience in handling emergency on board; their lack of experience in manoeuvring different types of vessels including bulk carriers and tankers and how to equip themselves with such navigational skills and knowledge. They were also asked about the potential effect of the reclamation works in the vicinity of Lantau Island with respect to navigational safety.
7. PAC considered the interview performance of both candidates satisfactory. As for the lack of experience in manoeuvring bulk carriers and tankers, PAC considered that HKPA should provide sufficient training for the apprentices to equip them with comprehensive skills and knowledge in tackling different types of vessels.

*Post-meeting note:* With the approval from the Pilotage Authority, both applicants registered as apprentice pilots on 15 January 2019.

### **III. Confirmation of the minutes of the last meeting held on 12 July 2018**

8. The minutes of last PAC meeting held on 12 July 2018 were confirmed subject to addition of a post-meeting note at para. 9(i) concerning HKPA's impending reply towards HKLSA's enquiries about manpower calculation and working hours subsequent to the last meeting vide an e-mail on 26 September 2018.

*Post-meeting note:* A post-meeting note was added subsequent to HKPA's reply via e-mail on 19 January 2019. The meeting minutes were uploaded to the website on 28 January 2019.

### **IV. Matters arising from the last meeting**

- (i) *"Simulation training for pilots" tabled by HKPA in last PAC*

9. Arising from para. 10 of the minutes of last PAC meeting held on 12 July 2018, GM/VTS reported that a working group meeting chaired by him had been convened on 31 October 2018. Most members in the working group agreed that the trainees should be able to gain some knowledge after the simulation training, the current arrangements of giving a remark of “satisfactory” vs “unsatisfactory” provided an opportunity for the coach pilots and the representative from MD to review different scenarios with the trainees to provide corrective feedback. Having said that, it was agreed to review the mode of simulation training to include more teaching elements such as prompting questions, responses and interaction. Improvement measures had been incorporated in simulation training since then. Trainees were well informed of different types of the scenarios beforehand and debriefing was conducted each time so that trainees would be able to learn from mistakes and do follow-up exercises. The Chairman noted and supported the direction of the working group.

(ii) *“Proposed pilotage dues adjustment mechanism” tabled by HKPA in last PAC*

10. Arising from para. 10 of the minutes of last PAC meeting held on 12 July 2018, a working group meeting had been convened on 31 October 2018. After discussion and given that HKLSA and HKPA were having a dialogue and agreed in principle on adjustment of pilotage dues, Bruce Lee, the then Chairman of HKPA suggested that HKPA’s proposal of adopting the fares adjustment formula of “0.3 x change in Composite Consumer Price Index + 0.7 x change in Nominal Salary Index” as the formula of annual adjustment rate could be shelved. Instead, PAC Paper No. 1/2019 on “Adjustment to Pilotage Dues” would be presented at this PAC meeting. The Chairman noted.

## V. Discussion item

### *PAC Paper No. 1/2019 – Adjustment to Pilotage Dues*

11. By way of background, the meeting noted that pilotage dues are commercial fees charged by licensed pilots for the provision of pilotage services. The fee levels would be reviewed from time to time by HKLSA and HKPA representing the service users and service providers respectively. The statute empowers the

Pilotage Authority to set the amount of pilotage dues by order published in the Gazette after consultation with PAC.

12. Bruce Lee presented the paper on behalf of HKPA. He said that HKLSA made no adverse comment vide an email of 7 December 2018 towards HKPA's proposal of adjustment to pilotage dues. He further elaborated the justifications of HKPA's proposal as follows –
- (a) 3.5% increase in most items set out vide Annex to the paper would be deemed reasonable compared with the aggregated rate of increase of the composite Consumer Price Index had been some 6% in the past three years;
  - (b) 25% increase in item 6 of part 2<sup>1</sup>, i.e. “detention fee” as the fee carried an element of deterrent; and
  - (c) 100% increase in item 4 of part 2<sup>2</sup> since that particular item had yet to be adjusted since 1998.
13. GM/VTS supplemented that the proposal at PAC Paper No. 1/2019 should be considered on an overall basis. The Chairman considered that with respect to para. 12(b), the parties should endeavour to avoid detention as far as time and manpower resources were concerned.
14. After discussion, the meeting endorsed PAC Paper No. 1/2019.

## **VII. Date of Next Meeting**

15. There being no other business, the meeting adjourned at 4:15 p.m. The date of the next meeting would be announced in due course.

**The minutes of the meeting were confirmed on 30 March 2020.**

---

<sup>1</sup> Where a pilot is detained there shall be payable for such detention an additional pilotage due of \$1,300 per half an hour or part thereof for the first hour, \$1,300 for the second hour or part thereof and \$1,300 per hour or part thereof for any further period of detention.

<sup>2</sup> An additional pilotage due of \$700 per half an hour or part thereof shall be payable for any pilotage service performed, where a pilot is required to proceed outwards beyond a pilot boarding area, from the time the ship passes a pilot boarding area outwards until the ship passes a pilot boarding area inwards.

Distribution list

Chairman, PAC  
Members, PAC  
SMO/VTC, MD  
MM/Pilotage, MD

Committee Unit  
Marine Department  
*Ref.:* L/M No. (21) in HQ/COM 928/29 (28)