

PILOTAGE ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Notes of Working Group Meeting

Date : 15 April 2016

Time : 2:30 p.m.

Venue : Conference Room A, 24/F, Harbour Building

Present

Chairman:	Mr WONG Wing-hung	General Manager/Vessel Traffic Services, Marine Department ('MD')
Members:	Mr MA Kam-fai	Hong Kong Liner Shipping Association
	Mr Marso LAW Kwun-pan	HK Pilots Association ('HKPA')
	Mr Danny YEUNG Wai-tin	HKPA
	Mr ZHOU Wei	Master Mariner
	Capt WU Ka-shun	Tug Operators
Secretary:	Mr Anson MC SINN	Executive Officer(Committee & General), MD

In attendance

Ms Catherine CHOW <i>(on behalf of Mr YIM Kong, Erik)</i>	Break Bulk Cargo Operators
Mr Cliff CHOW	Hongkong Salvage & Towage
Mr Jackson LAU	HKPA
Mr WANG Chi-cheong	HKPA
Mr Warren KP LI	Senior Marine Officer/Vessel Traffic Centre ('VTC'), MD
Mr George TANG	Marine Officer/Pilotage, MD

Absent with apologies

Members:	Mr NGAN Ping-man	Container Terminal Operators
	Mr John Barry WILSON	Master Mariner
	Mr ZHANG Zhi-liang	Dockyard Industry

I. Opening remarks

1. The Chairman welcomed all to the meeting.

II. Confirmation of notes of the last meeting

2. The notes of the last meeting held on 14 December 2015 were confirmed without amendment.

[Post-meeting note: The meeting notes were uploaded to the website of Marine Department on 19 May 2016.]

III. Discussion items

- (a) *Training, Assessment and Examination Arrangements for Apprentice, Class II and Class I Pilots (PACWG Paper No. 1/2016)*

3. Before presenting the PACWG Paper No. 1/2016 and with reference to para. 10 of the notes of the last meeting, Mr Marso Law of HKPA further elaborated his understanding of the “discrepancy” between para. 3.III.(e) of the notes of PACWG held on 26 June 2012 and Annex IV of PAC Paper No. 1/2013 as follows –

- (i) He quoted para. 3.III.(f) of the notes of PACWG held on 26 June 2012 that with regard to the practical vessel-training for Class IIF to IIB pilots, it was agreed that two practical vessel-training were set for vessel of next higher class. However, in Annex IV of PAC Paper No. 1/2013, the remarks stated that “all practical vessel training and assessments are set for vessel of next higher class.” As such, Mr Law commented that there was “discrepancy” between only Class IIF to IIB (excluding Class IIA) practical vessel-training should be set for vessel of next higher class.

- (ii) Mr Law followed by quoting that since the 2nd bullet point of para. 3.III.(e) of the notes of PACWG held on 26 June 2012 read as “for Class IIA, the arrangement would remain status quo that MD would join the HKPA

to conduct all the three practical assessments when the pilot applied for upgrading to Class I”, it should be interpreted that Class IIA practical vessel-training should be set for vessel of the same class in view of the difficulty to find some of the vessels (e.g. bulker and oil tanker) of certain lengths in the examination setting of upgrading of a Class IIA pilot to Class I.

In response, MO/Pilotage said that –

- (i) After deliberation at PAC meeting of 18 January 2013, the table at Annex IV of PAC Paper No. 1/2013 was amended as Appendix to PAC meeting minutes of 18 January 2013 which had been endorsed. MO/Pilotage referred to para. 12 of the meeting minutes that, one of the HKPA representatives pointed out that the elements of “2 practical vessel-training and 1 practical assessment” were missed out in the table at Annex IV of PAC Paper No. 1/2013. However, the PAC meeting minutes of 18 January 2013 did not address Mr Marso Law’s above concerns. It was not clear whether HKPA’s representatives addressed such concerns at the meeting at that time.
 - (ii) MD noted HKPA’s concern about the length of different types of vessels (container, bulker and oil tanker) in the joint practical assessment for upgrading of a Class IIA pilot to Class I jointly conducted by HKPA and MD, and agreed that the arrangements for upgrading to Class I pilot could be submitted separately at a later stage and therefore not included them in this discussion paper (PACWG Paper No. 1/2016).
4. MO/Pilotage then presented PACWG Paper No. 1/2016 in detail. The Chairman supplemented that this meeting would aim to reach consensus on training, assessment and examination arrangements for apprentice and Class II Pilots. As for Class I Pilots, there were still issues to be resolved with the Pilots. Taking into account that it would take at least six years for an apprentice pilot to be upgraded to a Class I Pilot, there would be sufficient lead time for further discussions with the Pilots.

5. The Chairman continued that MD would also wish to know the training, assessment and examination arrangements in other countries and asked if HKPA could help to research for the information. Mr Marso Law of HKPA responded that pilotage is linked with local environment, such as depth profile of the waters. As such, it might not be appropriate to follow suit the arrangements of other countries. The Chairman explained that the purpose of researching the arrangements of other countries was to serve as a reference only; he did not mean to directly adopt the arrangements of other countries in Hong Kong.
 6. Mr Danny Yeung, HKPA enquired about the design of the pilot's record books and licences in future. MO/Pilotage replied that the details of the updated Schedule(s) to Cap. 84C, subject to the enactment of the Pilotage (Amendment) Order 2016, would be listed out in the new pilot record books.
 7. Mr Danny Yeung, HKPA enquired as to simulation training, whether it could be changed from "conducted by MD and Pilots" to "conducted by MD and/or Pilots". The Chairman responded that MD would have its responsibility to oversee the overall training, assessment and examination arrangements.
 8. After deliberations, PACWG Paper No. 1/2016 was endorsed subject to the amendments (marked up in track change mode) set out in *Appendix* to the meeting notes.
- (b) *Establishment of Traffic Separation Scheme ('TSS') and Pilotage Service in Mirs Bay*
9. The Chairman briefed members on the planned establishment of TSS in Mirs Bay and the intention of reinstate compulsory pilotage in the area.
 10. He briefed members with the history of the case and quoted the tenfold increase in Yantian's container throughput since 1998. In view of the increased marine traffic flow resulting in higher navigational risk, a review on reinstating compulsory pilotage in Mirs Bay was required.

11. Meanwhile, MD was also working together with Shenzhen Maritime Safety Administration ('SZMSA') on the establishment of Traffic Separation Schemes ('TSS') in Mirs Bay. SMO/VTC showed the preliminary design of the TSS which had been agreed with the consultant employed by SZMSA. However, the design would still require further consultation with Mainland stakeholders. The planned TSS would be partially in HK waters and partially in Mainland waters.
12. The Chairman explained that the TSS would not require to amend local legislation but would require to be adopted by IMO for the application of Rule 10 of the International Regulations for Preventing Collisions at Sea.
13. Mr Zhou Wei enquired any accidents around Mirs Bay. The Chairman replied that notwithstanding that the accidents around Mirs Bay were of minor nature, there were still potential risks to navigational safety. The purpose of implementing the TSS was to better organise the marine traffic in Mirs Bay. In addition, MD had been reviewing the possibility of shared vessel traffic services data with SZMSA to enhance co-operation with a view to ensuring navigational safety in the area.
14. Mr Ma Kam-fai enquired the possibility of exemption of compulsory pilotage for particular vessels but made such certain types of vessels as liquefied natural gas ('LNG') vessels and dangerous good carriers compulsory pilotage. Meanwhile, Capt Wu Ka-shun asked about the possibility of partial exemption of compulsory pilotage in the event of inclement weather. The Chairman noted their comments.
15. Capt Wu Ka-shun then enquired on the implementation timeframe. The Chairman replied that the earliest submission date of the TSS to IMO could be March 2017.
16. Mr Danny Yeung, HKPA enquired any lead time for HKPA to prepare in the event of reinstating compulsory pilotage. MO/Pilotage replied that while no legislation amendment would be required for reinstating pilotage requirement in Mirs

Bay, it would be necessary to amend the Pilotage Ordinance (Cap. 84) and its sub-legislation for new pilot boarding stations and possible revision of pilotage dues. As such, there might still be a legislative process.

IV. Adjournment of meeting

17. There being no other business, the meeting adjourned at 5:40 p.m.

V. Date of next meeting

18. The date of next meeting will be announced in due course.

[Post-meeting note: The next meeting would be scheduled for 20.12.2016 at 2:30 p.m. at Conference Room B.]

CONFIRMED the meeting notes 20th day of December 2016.

Distribution list

Chairman, PAC WG
Members, PAC WG
Ms Catherine CHOW
Mr Cliff CHOW
Mr Jackson LAU
Mr WANG Chi-cheong
SMO/VTC, MD
MO/Pilotage, MD

c.c.

AD(PC), MD
DD, MD

Committee Unit
Marine Department
Ref.: HQ/COM 928/19(7)

Appendix to PACWG meeting notes of 15 April 2016

The following tables list out the amendments in track change mode based on *Annex II of PACWG Paper No. 1/2016*.

Proposed Arrangements for Training, Assessment and Examination for Apprentice ~~and Class II~~ and ~~Class I~~ Pilots¹

	Apprentice To IIF	IIF To IIE	IIE To IID	IID To IIC	IIC To IIB	IIB To IIA	IIA To I	I
Simulation Training (MD & Pilots)	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	-
Practical Vessel Training (Pilots)	Cap.84C, S1-	2	2	2	2	2	2	-
Practical Assessment (Pilots)	3	1	1	-	1	1	1	-
Practical Examination (MD & Pilots)	1	-	-	1	-	-	3*	-
Oral Examination (PAC)	1	-	-	-	-	-	1	-
Written Examination (MD)	1	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
<u>Experience required</u>	<u>Schedule</u> <u>1 to</u> <u>Cap.84C</u>	<u>Schedule</u> <u>3 to</u> <u>Cap.84C</u>	<u>Schedule</u> <u>3 to</u> <u>Cap.84C</u>	<u>Schedule</u> <u>3 to</u> <u>Cap.84C</u>	<u>Schedule</u> <u>3 to</u> <u>Cap.84C</u>	<u>Schedule</u> <u>3 to</u> <u>Cap.84C</u>		
Continued Proficiency Development Programme (Pilots)	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	1

Note*: Subject to further discussion

¹ Revised from Annex II to PACWG Paper No. 5/2015, retrievable from http://www.mardep.gov.hk/en/aboutus/pdf/pacwgp5_15.pdf

Pilot Class	Maximum Length	Training, Assessment and Examination for Upgrading to Class IIF	
Apprentice	NA	Simulation training (MD and Pilots)	Simulation training conducted by MD and Pilots
		<u>3 practical assessments (Pilots)</u> Practical vessel training – (Pilots)	<u>Piloting & berthing a ship of any type with LOA from >80m to ≤160m on 3 occasions.</u> Training as per Cap. 84C Schedule 1
		<u>1 joint practical examination (MD and Pilots)</u> <u>3 practical assessments (Pilots)</u>	<u>Piloting & berthing a ship of any type with LOA from >80m to ≤160m on 1 occasion. (i) Piloting & berthing a bulker or tanker ship with LOA from >80m to ≤160m on 2 occasions;</u> <u>(ii) Piloting & berthing a container ship with LOA from >80m to ≤160m on 1 occasion.</u>
		<u>Oral examination (PAC)</u> 1 joint practical examination (MD and Pilots)	<u>As per Annex IV to PACWG Paper No. 1/2016 Piloting & berthing a ship of any type with LOA from >80m to ≤160m on 1 occasion.</u>
		<u>Written examination (MD)</u> Oral examination – (PAC)	As per <i>Annex IV</i> to PACWG Paper No. 1/2016
		<u>Experience _____ required</u> <u>Written examination (MD)</u>	<u>As required under Schedule 1 to Cap. 84C. As per Annex IV to PACWG Paper No. 1/2016</u>

Pilot Class	Maximum Length	Training, Assessment and Examination for Upgrading to Class IIE	
IIF	160m	Simulation training (MD and Pilots)	Simulation training should comprise of at least 6 exercise scenarios, include piloting, berthing, anchoring and crisis management of vessels with LOA from >160m to ≤ 180m or a length appropriate to the role played in various locations within HK waters. Candidate should complete all 6 training scenarios and :- (i) taking the role of pilot in charge in 2 scenarios; (ii) taking the role of a member of the bridge team in 2 scenarios; and (iii) taking any roles in the wheelhouse in 2 scenarios.
		2 practical vessel-training (Pilots)	Piloting & berthing a ship of any type with LOA from >160m to ≤180m on 2 occasions. (i) Piloting & berthing a bulker or tanker ship with LOA from >160m to ≤180m on 1 occasion; and (ii) Piloting & berthing a container ship with LOA from >160m to ≤180m on 1 occasion.
		1 practical assessment (Pilots)	Piloting & berthing a ship of any type with LOA from >160m to ≤180m on 1 occasion.
		<u>Experience required</u>	<u>As required under Schedule 3 to Cap.84C.</u>

Pilot Class	Maximum Length	Training, Assessment and Examination for Upgrading to Class IID	
IIE	180m	Simulation training (MD and Pilots)	Simulation training should comprise of at least 6 exercise scenarios, include piloting, berthing, anchoring and crisis management of vessels length from >180m to ≤210m or a length appropriate to the role played in various locations within HK waters. Candidate should complete all 6 training scenarios and:- (i) taking the role of pilot in charge in 2 scenarios; (ii) taking the role of a member of the bridge team in 2 scenarios; and (iii) taking any roles in the wheelhouse in 2 scenarios.
		2 practical vessel-training (Pilots)	Piloting & berthing a ship of any type with LOA from >180m to ≤210m on 2 occasions. (i) Piloting & berthing a bulker or tanker ship with LOA from >180m to ≤210m on 1 occasion; and (ii) Piloting & berthing a container ship with LOA from >180m to ≤210m on 1 occasion.
		1 practical assessment (Pilots)	Piloting & berthing a ship of any type with LOA from >180m to ≤210m on 1 occasion.
		<u>Experience required</u>	<u>As required under Schedule 3 to Cap.84C.</u>

Pilot Class	Maximum Length	Training, Assessment and Examination for Upgrading to Class IIC	
IID	210m	Simulation training (MD and Pilots)	Simulation training should comprise of at least 6 exercise scenarios, include piloting, berthing, anchoring and crisis management of vessels length from >210m to ≤ 250m or a length appropriate to the role played in various locations within HK waters. Candidate should complete all 6 training scenarios and:- (i) taking the role of pilot in charge in 2 scenarios; (ii) taking the role of a member of the bridge team in 2 scenarios; and (iii) taking any roles in the wheelhouse in 2 scenarios.
		2 practical vessel-training (Pilots)	Piloting & berthing a ship of any type with LOA from >210m to ≤250m on 2 occasions. (i) Piloting & berthing a bulker or tanker ship with LOA from >210m to ≤250m on 1 occasion; and (ii) Piloting & berthing a container of ship with LOA from >210m to ≤250m on 1 occasion.
		1 joint practical examination (MD and Pilots)	(i) Piloting & berthing a bulker or tanker ship with LOA from >210m to ≤250m on 1 occasion.
		<u>Experience required</u>	<u>As required under Schedule 3 to Cap.84C.</u>

Pilot Class	Maximum Length	Training, Assessment and Examination for Upgrading to Class IIB	
IIC	250m	Simulation training (MD and Pilots)	Simulation training should comprise of at least 6 exercise scenarios, include piloting, berthing, anchoring and crisis management of vessels length from >250m to ≤300m or a length appropriate to the role played in various locations within HK waters. Candidate should complete all 6 training scenarios and :- (i) taking the role of pilot in charge in 2 scenarios; (ii) taking the role of a member of the bridge team in 2 scenarios; and (iii) — taking any roles in the wheelhouse in 2 scenarios.
		2 practical vessel-training (Pilots)	Piloting & berthing a ship of any type with LOA from >250m to ≤300m on 2 occasions. (i) Piloting & berthing a bulker or tanker ship with LOA from >250m to ≤300m on 1 occasion. (ii) Piloting & berthing a container ship with LOA from >250m to ≤300m on 1 occasion
		1 practical assessment (Pilots)	Piloting & berthing a <u>ship of any type</u> bulker or tanker ship with LOA from >250m to ≤300m on 1 occasion.
		<u>Experience required</u>	<u>As required under Schedule 3 to Cap.84C.</u>

Pilot Class	Maximum Length	Training, Assessment and Examination for Upgrading to Class IIA	
IIB	300m	Simulation training (MD and Pilots)	Simulation training should comprise of at least 6 exercise scenarios, include piloting, berthing, anchoring and crisis management of vessels length from >300m to ≤ 350m or a length appropriate to the role played in various locations within HK waters. Candidate should complete all 6 training scenarios and:- (i) taking the role of pilot in charge in 2 scenarios; (ii) taking the role of a member of the bridge team in 2 scenarios; and (iii) taking any roles in the wheelhouse in 2 scenarios.
		2 practical vessel-training (Pilots)	Piloting & berthing a ship of any type with LOA from >300m to ≤350m on 2 occasions.
		1 practical assessment (Pilots)	Piloting & berthing a ship of any type with LOA from >300m to ≤350m on 1 occasion.
		<u>Experience required</u>	<u>As required under Schedule 3 to Cap.84C.</u>

Pilot Class	Maximum Length	Training, Assessment and Examination for Upgrading to Class I	
H-A	350m	Simulation training (MD and Pilots)	Simulation training should comprise of at least 6 exercise scenarios, include piloting, berthing, anchoring and crisis management of heavy laden bulkers, tankers and vessels with LOA >350m or a length appropriate to the role played in various locations within HK waters. Candidate should complete all 6 training scenarios and :- (i) taking the role of pilot in charge in 2 scenarios; (ii) taking the role of a member of the bridge team in 2 scenarios; and (iii) taking any roles in the wheelhouse in 2 scenarios.
		2 practical vessel training (Pilots)	Piloting & berthing a ship of any type with LOA >350m but need not be >360m on 2 occasions.
		1 practical assessment (Pilots)	Piloting & berthing a ship of any type with LOA >350m but need not be >360m on 1 occasion.
		3 joint practical examination (MD and Pilots)	Subject to further discussion
		Oral Examination (PAC)	As per <i>Annex VI</i> to PACWG Paper No. 1/2016

Pilot Class	Maximum Length	Training & Assessment	
I	Any Length	Continued Proficiency Development Programme (Pilots)	In a 5-year cycle comprises of lectures on professional topics, application of modern electronic navigational aids and simulation practice.

The amendments in track change mode are set out below based on *Annex IV of PACWG Paper No. 1/2016*.

Proposed Examination Syllabuses for Class II Pilots

Examination Syllabus (Proposed in April 2016)

For amending from Apprentice Pilot to Class IIF Pilot

Practical Examination

The practical examination consists of one berthing of a ~~dry cargo/bulker ship, a tanker ship, or a container ship~~ ship of any type with LOA from >80m to ≤160m ~~of not less than 80m and not greater than 160m~~ to any ~~dry cargo/bulker/tanker~~ berth as appropriate.

Written Examination

- (i) Knowledge of Pilotage Ordinance (Cap. 84) and the Berthing Guidelines;
- (ii) Navigational knowledge of the Hong Kong waters :-
 - (a) Tidal streams, depths and shoals throughout Hong Kong waters;
 - (b) Characteristics of all lights, buoys, beacons, bridge lighting system and harbour facilities throughout Hong Kong waters;
 - (c) Depths and scope of berth at all Government mooring buoys; and
 - (d) Limits of local pilotage areas including prohibited areas, anchorages and areas of restriction of any kind;
- (iii) Knowledge of ship handling:-
 - (a) Berthing and unberthing at various wharves, piers, buoys, etc. in Hong Kong under the influence of wind, current and tide;
 - (b) Manoeuvring behaviour of the types of ships expected to be piloted and the limitations imposed by particular propulsion and steering systems;

- (c) Precautions to be taken when passing close to other vessels underway or at moorings;
 - (d) The effects of and the uses to which transverse thrust may be put. The effects when used in conjunction with a bow thruster;
 - (e) Turning short round. The use of the anchor when manoeuvring or berthing;
 - (f) Use and limitation of various types of tugs; and
 - (g) Precautions to be taken when using lines to mooring buoy;
- (iv) Relationship with Master:-
- (a) Information which pilot should obtain from Master upon boarding e.g. Handling characteristics of ship, type of cargo (D.G. etc.), defect or damage to ship which might affect ship handling;
 - (b) Information which pilot should offer to Master upon boarding e.g. Preparations for mooring, berthing, anchoring, signals required, use of VHF etc.;
 - (c) Advice to Master riding out typhoons in Hong Kong harbour or anchorages; and
 - (d) Undue interference from Master;
- and
- (v) Handling emergency conditions, i.e. collision with other vessel grounding, loss of steering, loss of propulsion, failure of vital systems and automation etc. in a narrow channel or fairway.

.../

Oral Examination

A comprehensive knowledge of :-

- (i) Syllabus contained in the written examination;
- (ii) The bridge equipment and navigational aids used for navigation, i.e. radar, Automatic Identification System (AIS), Electronic Chart Display and Information System (ECDIS) etc.;
- (iii) Systems of radio navigational warning broadcasts in Hong Kong and the type of information broadcast;
- (iv) International Regulations for Preventing Collisions at Sea 1972 as amended, port regulations and pollution prevention rules;
- (v) Use of VHF in accordance with the International recognized standards;
- (vi) Hong Kong Merchant Shipping Notice, Hong Kong Merchant Shipping Information Notes and Marine Department Notices (MDN); and
- (vii) Collection of evidence in incidents.

Other Requirements

The candidate is required to produce the following training records² to the Pilotage Authority:

- (i) [Appropriate experience as required under Schedule 1 to Cap.84C](#);
- (ii) Simulation training;
- (iii) 3 practical assessments; and
- (~~iii~~iv) ~~any~~ [Any](#) other training and courses attended.

² [Para. 8 of Cap. 84C.](#)

**For amending from Class IIF to Class IIE Pilots
And from Class IIE to Class IID Pilots**

The candidate is required to produce the following training records to the Pilotage Authority:

- (i) [Experience required under Schedule 3 to Cap.84C](#);
- (ii) [Simulation training](#);
- (iii) 2 practical vessel training;
- (~~iii~~iv) 1 practical assessment; and
- (iv) ~~any~~ [Any](#) other training and courses attended.

For amending from Class IID to Class IIC Pilot

Practical Examination

The practical examination consists of one berthing of a ~~dry cargo/bulker ship~~ or ~~a~~ tanker ship with LOA from >210m to ≤250m to any dry ~~cargo/bulker/~~ or tanker berth as appropriate.

Other Requirements

The candidate is required to produce the following training records to the Pilotage Authority:

- (i) Experience required under Schedule 3 to Cap.84C;
- (ii) Simulation training;
- (iii) 2 practical vessel training;
- (iii) 1 practical assessment; and
- (iv) ~~any~~ Any other training and courses attended.

**For amending from Class IIC to Class IIB Pilots
And from Class IIB to Class IIA Pilots**

The candidate is required to produce the following training records to the Pilotage Authority:

- (i) [Experience required under Schedule 3 to Cap.84C;](#)
- (ii) [Simulation training;](#)
- (iii) 2 practical vessel training;
- (~~iii~~iv) 1 practical assessment; and
- (iv) ~~any~~ [Any](#) other training and courses attended.

In addition, *Annex V* ‘Syllabus for Class I Pilots endorsed in PAC meeting held on 30 June 2005’ and *Annex VI* ‘Proposed Examination Syllabuses for Class I Pilot’ of PACWG Paper No. 1/2016 have been put off upon the discussion at the PACWG meeting of 15 April 2016 (paragraph 4 of the meeting notes refers).

Ends.