

**PILOTAGE ADVISORY COMMITTEE
MINUTES OF MEETING**

Date : 2 December 2022 (Friday)
Format : Conference Room A, 24/F Harbour Building
Time : 3 p.m.

Present

Chairman:	WONG Sai-fat	Deputy Director (1), Marine Department (“MD”)
Members:	CHAN Hung-tai	Hong Kong Liner Shipping Association
	CHAN Kam-foo	Shipping Agencies
	LAM Wing-chiu	Container Terminal Operators
	LAU Yiu-ming	Oil Terminal Operators
	ZHONG Ying	Dockyard Industry
	Ms LEI Ho-yan, Angelina	Tug operators
	Capt LI Yongzheng	Master Mariner
	Capt CHAN Kam-wing	Master Mariner
	Capt TSANG Cheuk-yin, Joe	Master Mariner
	Capt WANG Chi-cheong	Licensed Pilot to the Hong Kong Pilots Association (HKPA)
	LAI Chi-tung	Assistant Director / Port Control, MD
	HUANG Jihe	General Manager / Vessel Traffic Services, MD
	PI Xianzhong	Surveyor of Ships (Engineer) / Seafarers and Examination (2), MD
Secretary:	Ms Athena LIU	Executive Officer (General & Committee), MD

Absent with apologies

ZHANG Hongwen	Hong Kong Shipowners Association
LI Yubin	Break Bulk Cargo Operators
CHANG Chi-wai, Robson	Dry Bulk Cargo Terminal Operators

I. Opening Remarks

1. The Chairman extended his welcome to all members. The Chairman advised the meeting that three members were absent from the meeting with apologies. One of the members representing one of the licensed pilots had resigned from PAC in October 2022.

II. Confirmation of the minutes of the last meeting held on 25 October 2022

2. The minutes of last PAC meeting held on 25 October 2022 were confirmed without amendment.

(Post-meeting note: The meeting minutes were uploaded to the MD website on 14 December 2022.)

III. Discussion items

PAC Paper No. 10/2022 – Discussion Paper on The Proposed Berthing Guidelines for the Hong Kong Offshore Liquefied Natural Gas Terminal (the Terminal)

3. HKPA presented powerpoint slides on the proposed requirement of 2 pilots for the berthing and unberthing of LNG vessels to/from the Terminal. In general, it was presented that all tankers and bulkers with LOA>220m require 2 pilots at present. The use of 2 pilots has a very low accident rate and is the industry's practice to best minimize risks. HKPA suggested to members that such existing good industry practice should be followed. As the Terminal is new to Hong Kong, members should consider to adopt a higher standard to ensure navigational safety. Furthermore, there are also sensitive areas around the proposed pilotage route such as the Marine Park and the South Cheung Chau Dumping Ground which have narrowed the route to around only 500m. With regard to the duties of co-pilot, HKPA elaborated that the co-pilot would mainly carry out master-pilot information exchange and would also be responsible for specialized equipment set up, bridge resource management, deployment of tugs, guard boat etc. as well as communicating with Vessel Traffic Centre whenever necessary, immediate taking over of the Chief Pilot when necessary, monitoring the whole pilotage passage, responding to sudden change of adverse environment condition and handling emergency. In fact, it noted that when doing LNG ship simulation that the LNG vessel has very

slow response, high windage and deep draft comparing to the depth of water along the proposed pilotage route. Indeed, all pilots are required to be specially trained for the service of piloting LNG vessels.

4. MD advised the meeting that the following points of the proposed berthing guidelines for the Terminal have been agreed in the PAC Working Group Meeting held on 3 November 2022 –
 - (a) no turning basin would be adopted and to delete the wording of “at Turning Basin / Berth” for both the east berth and the west berth;
 - (b) to revise the Max. Draft from 13m (min 10% UKC) to 12.5m (min 15% UKC) for both the east berth and the west berth of the Terminal, subject to the outcome of water depth survey along the proposed route by MD;
 - (c) operation time for berthing to both berths of the Terminal to be Day HW-2 to HW+1;
 - (d) to remove the General Remarks 1 for the west berth, considering that one (1) pilot remaining on board during the vessel’s stay at berth was not performing pilotage services;
 - (e) to remove the General Remarks 3 for the west berth and the General Remark 2 for the east berth, considering that it has overlapped with General Remarks 2 and General Remark 1 respectively; and
 - (f) to remove General Remarks 6 & 7 for the west berth and General Remark 5 & 6 for the east berth on the standby location of tug boats and employment of guard tugs, considering that they are irrelevant to the berthing guidelines
5. All members agreed to paragraph 4.
6. The Chairman noted that the PAC Working Group (WG) has different views on the requirements of 2 pilots for berthing and unberthing of vessels to/from the Terminal during its meeting held on 3 November 2022. An email was circulated to WG members on 3 November after the meeting to seek members’ view of the way forward on this issue. By the deadline, out of 10 members joined the meeting, 9 of them opted to submit the issue to PAC for discussion. There was one member opted to further discuss the matter at WG level. As such, the PAC meeting today aimed to resolve the issue and that navigational safety is the only consideration in the discussion to determine whether 1 or 2 pilots is/are required. In order to facilitate the discussion, all gathered relevant

materials will be tabled and presented to members for consideration and professional judgement.

7. MD had collected some information with regard to the number of pilot(s) required for piloting LNG vessels in other countries and tabled the findings to members. The gathered information showed that some overseas LNG terminals use one pilot while some use two. MD remarked also that the MoL LNG Transport (Asia) Ltd. (the owner and operator of the Floating Storage and Re-gasification Unit (FSRU) which will berth at the east berth of the Terminal) advised MD that they did not request for 2 pilots boarding FSRU for berthing or unberthing the Terminal. It is the requirement made by the Terminal owner/operator for 2 pilots to board LNG vessels for arrival and departure. Regarding the say that the Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) report has required for 2 pilots as mentioned by the representative of the CLP Power Hong Kong Limited at the WG meeting, the Environmental and Ecology Bureau on 25 November 2022 replied to MD's enquiry that there is no such requirement in the EIA report.
8. In response to HKPA's email to WG members on 21 November 2022 quoting the advice from the International Maritime Pilots Association (IMPA) that the number of maritime pilots used for LNG vessels generally around the world is two, MD presented further advice from the IMPA stating that on the other hand, the unique circumstances of LNG terminals around the world and the systems of pilotage in individual States mean that two may not be a necessary or appropriate as risk control measure at the Terminal. MD opined that adding the number of pilot would not help addressing the concerns on the relatively poor manoeuvrability of laden LNG vessels and /or FSRU mentioned in paragraph 3 above. On the contrary, adding number or power of tugs would help smooth and safe turning of these vessels along the proposed pilotage route.
9. MD further supplemented with 4 radar track plottings of ships' movements which were captured on 21 November 2022. In the 4 selected areas (i.e. Dangan Channel, East Lamma Channel, Waters in the vicinity of South Lamma Anchorages and Waters in the vicinity of the Terminal), it was found that the traffic in the vicinity of the Terminal was light. On this point, HKPA questioned the plots which might not have taken lesser fishing vessels into the account given the pandemic situation. MD replied that that area is not a fishing

hot spot and that mainland river trade vessels would not be allowed to navigate in the vicinity, and highspeed vessels would use the proposed pilotage route as a backup route only. As such, the radar track plottings are truly reflecting the light traffic situation in the vicinity of the Terminal.

10. On the EIA report's requirement matter, HKPA advised that plural form of "pilot" has been used in Chapter 3.5.1. MD supplemented that a single form for the requirement of pilot was also used in the same chapter, i.e. "to pick up a pilot".
11. With regard to the powerpoint presented by HKPA, MD supplemented that a principle fairway system will be established in accordance with international standard at the south of the Shek Kwu Chau for providing a safe passageway for LNG vessels. As for the low water depths near the second turning points in No.4 slide of the powerpoint, MD remarked that those low water depths seemingly do not exist in the latest nautical charts. If following the depth as shown in HKPA's powerpoint, the Max. draft in the berthing guideline for the Terminal might have to be further adjusted which would be subjected to further survey from MD.
12. On the point of sensitive areas along the proposed pilotage route for LNG vessels, MD clarified that marine park allows vessels to navigate with speed restriction of 10 knots and no anchoring is allowed.
13. MD drew members' attention to the Annex 2 of IMO's Resolution A.960(23) which makes recommendation on operational procedures for maritime pilots other than deep-sea pilots by setting a clear set of role and information to be exchanged between master and pilot. In accordance with the Resolution, pilot-master information exchange should be conducted by the pilot who is in charge of ship's navigation. Such information exchange should not be assigned to any other persons for instance the co-pilot who is not controlling the navigation of the ship. MD pointed out further that the master-pilot information exchange which should include at least the general agreement on plans and procedures and contingency plan for anticipated passage, local special conditions such as weather, depth of water as well as unusual ship-handling characteristics etc. is important for the pilot in charge of ship's navigation to ensure safety of the ship being piloted and proper navigational decision on what speeds to go and what courses to steer etc. In response to

MD's comments, HKPA reiterated that the pilot would mainly focus on the navigation of ship while other duties including master-pilot information exchange would be shared out by the co-pilot.

[Post-meeting notes : After the meeting, Rockman Tao and TK Chan of HKPA supplemented that Para. 5.1 in the Annex 2 of the IMO's Resolution A. 960 (23) under the subject of "Master – Pilot Information Exchange" has only stated "In accordance with the Resolution, the master and the pilot should exchange information regarding navigational procedures, local conditions and rules and the ship's characteristics. This information exchange should be a continuous process that generally continues for the duration of the pilotage.".]

14. As for sudden change of adverse environment condition and handling emergency, MD opined that all licensed pilots when providing pilotage services are expected to be able to respond properly according to the prevailing situation. As a matter of fact, responses to sudden change of environment and various emergency situation, e.g. sudden reduction of visibility due to fog or heavy rain, engine or steering gear failure etc, are part of pilots' normal training programme.
15. MD further shared the meeting with the definition of pilot in Cap. 84: pilot means (a) a person who controls, or is in charge of, the navigation of a ship of which he is not the master; and (b) when used as a verb, to control, or be in charge of, the navigation of a ship. Separately, MD suggested the meeting to think about whether there is any correlation between navigational difficulty due to new route and the number of pilots required. The meeting might also consider whether other navigation measures might possibly help to address the navigational difficulty e.g. health requirement and training.
16. Capt. LI enquired and confirmed by HKPA that all tankers and bulkers with LOA>220 m as required by the berthing guidelines are 2 pilots now. Capt. LI questioned why 2 pilots are required for unberthing operations, considering that it is relatively easy to comprehend. The Chairman supplemented that 2 pilots and 1 pilot are required for berthing and unberthing LNGCs respectively in Japan. HKPA explained that the process of unberthing might also have emergent situation given that the Terminal is located in a more exposed area.

17. Capt. TSANG advised that service charges might be one of the commercial elements to consider. Some ports require 2 pilots for the consideration of the following factors, e.g. vessel length and width, water depth, kind of cargoes on board, pilotage duration and day / night time etc. He shared the meeting with some concerns that he had noticed in the past years from the industry requesting for necessary review and relaxation of 2-pilot requirements in Hong Kong. He concurred with Capt. LI's view that unberthing might not require 2 pilots given it is only just 500m away from the southern boundary of Hong Kong. While he agreed with HKPA that the Terminal is a new one which may deserve to consider whether 2 pilots are required, he suggested the meeting to consider whether to implement 2 pilots first for a trial period of 12 months so that the existing 12 pilots can familiarize themselves to the new route during the period and subject to review afterwards. On this, HKPA supplemented that 2 pilots are required during the berth trial period. HKPA welcomed trial arrangement and counter proposed to adopt number of voyages instead of number of months as the criterion for the accumulation of sufficient experience for pilots.
18. Mr. CHAN asked what scenario would cause the vessel to navigate near the dumping area at the turning point when approaching the Terminal. He asked whether the requirement of 1 or 2 pilots for the Terminal will have implications to other terminals in berthing guidelines. He opined that whether the 2-pilot requirement for passenger ships to and from cruise terminals should also be reviewed as appropriate. The Chairman suggested the meeting to focus on the issue of pilotage arrangement for the Terminal in this meeting.
19. Mr. LAM checked and advised that there are 47 pages of "2 pilots" in the existing berthing guidelines. He commented that 2 pilots are not that uncommon.
20. After deliberation, the Chairman suggested the meeting to vote under secret ballot on the issue of the number of pilot required for LNG vessels for berthing and unberthing the Terminal. The Chairman also suggested that the ballot should exclude the votes of the Chairman, 3 official members of MD and HKPA. HKPA and members have no comment to the suggestions. Members would have 3 matters to vote for, i.e. (a) 1 or 2 pilot(s) required for berthing to the Terminal, (b) 1 or 2 pilot(s) required for unberthing from the Terminal

and (c) 6 months, 12 months, or unnecessary for trial period.

21. The results of the three separate votes are as follows-

Matter	1 pilot	2 pilots
(a) Berthing	3 votes	<u>6 votes</u>
(b) Unberthing	<u>6 votes</u>	3 votes

Matter	6 months	12 months	Unnecessary For trial run
(c) Trial period	2 votes	<u>7 votes</u>	<u>Nil</u>

22. The meeting concluded that 2 pilots are required for berthing and 1 pilot is required for unberthing, with a 12-month trial period. Key Performance Indicator, if any, for the trial period will be discussed in due course through paper circulation. The meeting's conclusion would be submitted to the Pilotage Authority (i.e. Director of Marine) for consideration and adoption as appropriate.
23. For the remaining areas of the PAC Paper No. 10/2022, MD remarked that a typo was spotted for the maximum LOA of CVX (main berth) and advised the meeting that it would be revised from 235m to 250m. Members noted MD's remark and offered no further comments to the paper.
24. HKPA expressed disappointment to the 1 pilot only for unberthing and advised that pilots might not provide pilotage service for the Terminal if such is the decision. The Chairman responded that this is not a decision made by individual person and hoped that HKPA could respect the discussion and decision made by the PAC as a whole.

V. Any Other Business

25. There was no other business.

VI. Date of next meeting

26. The meeting adjourned at 5:30 p.m. The date of the next meeting would be announced in due course.

Distribution list

Chairman, PAC

Members, PAC