

PILOTAGE ADVISORY COMMITTEE MINUTES OF MEETING

Date : 29 June 2016 (Wednesday)
Place : Conference Room A, 24/F, Harbour Building
Time : 2:30 p.m.

Present

Chairman: Mr H M TUNG Deputy Director,
Marine Department ('MD')

Members: Mr ZHANG Zhi-liang Dockyard Industry
Ms Betty POON Dry Bulk Cargo Operators
(on behalf of Ms Caroline LU Zheng)
Mr MA Kam-fai HK Liner Shipping Association
Capt LAM Ming-fung, Lothair Hong Kong Shipowners
Association

Mr WANG Chi-cheong Hong Kong Pilots Association
('HKPA')
(on behalf of Mr Marso LAW, Chairman of HKPA)
Mr Danny YEUNG Wai-tin HKPA
Mr John Barry WILSON Master Mariner
Mr NG Che-kan, Deforest Shipping Agencies
Capt WU Ka-shun Tug Operators
Mr C T LAI Assistant Director /
Port Control, MD

Mr W H WONG General Manager ('GM') /
Vessel Traffic Services, MD

Mr Y W LEE Surveyor of Ships (Nautical)
Examiner, MD

Secretary: Mr Anson MC SINN Executive Officer
(Committee & General), MD

In attendance

Mr Warren KP LI	Senior Marine Officer ('SMO') / Vessel Traffic Centre ('VTC'), MD
Mr George TANG	Marine Officer ('MO') / Pilotage, MD
Mr K. F. CHAN	Wallem Shipping (HK) Limited
Mr Jackson LAU	HKPA
Mr SHIU Kin-fai	HKPA
Mr Jerry LO	Hongkong Salvage & Towage
Mr Cliff CHOW	Hongkong Salvage & Towage

Absent with apologies

Mr YIM Kong, Erik	Break Bulk Cargo Operators
Mr NGAN Ping-man	Container Terminal Operators
Mr ZHOU Wei	Master Mariner
Dr NG Jim-mi, Jimmy	Master Mariner
Mr LEUNG Kwan-hang	Oil Terminal Operators

OPENING REMARKS

Action

1. The Chairman welcomed all to the meeting. He extended his welcome particularly to the following attendees –

Attending on behalf of others:

- Ms Betty Poon, who attended the meeting on behalf of Ms Caroline Lu Zheng, representing dry bulk cargo operators; and
- Mr Wang Chi-cheong, who attended the meeting on behalf of Mr Marso Law, Chairman of HKPA.

AGENDA ITEMS

I. Interview of apprentice pilots

2. The Chairman informed the meeting that one candidate, Mr Hui Ka-ki who had already passed the physical fitness and eyesight test would be interviewed.

3. Mr Hui was asked to brief members on his academic background and work experience in the maritime industry. He was also questioned on the biggest challenge as a pilot, experience in manoeuvring different types of vessels, the impending legislative amendment Pilotage (Amendment) Order 2016 on different classes of pilotage service, etc.
4. Members were satisfied with the qualifications and experience of Mr Hui, and agreed to recommend him to the Pilotage Authority for registration as an apprentice pilot.

Post-meeting note: With the approval from the Pilotage Authority, Mr Hui registered as an apprentice pilot on 29 June 2016.

II. Confirmation of the minutes of the last meeting

5. The draft minutes of the last meeting held on 7 January 2016 had been sent to members for comment(s) in early May 2016. As no comment was received, the minutes were confirmed at this meeting.

Post-meeting note: The minutes of meeting were uploaded to MD's website on 6 July 2016.¹

III. Matters Arising from Previous Minutes of Meeting

(a) PAC Paper No. 2/2015 – Adjustment to Pilotage Dues

6. Mr George Tang, MO/Pilotage reported that the Pilotage (Dues) (Amendment) Order 2016 was published in the gazette on 20 May 2016 and tabled at the Legislative Council ('LegCo') for negative vetting on 25 May 2016. The revised Pilotage (Dues) Order, Cap. 84D would commence on 18 July 2016.

(b) PAC Paper No. 2/2014 – Proposed Amendments to the Pilotage Order, Cap. 84C (Appropriate Experience of Applicant)

7. Mr George Tang, MO/Pilotage reported that members of LegCo Panel on Economic Development endorsed the proposal to amend the Pilotage (Amendment) Order 2016. Upon internal clearance, it was envisaged that the Transport and Housing Bureau ('THB') would table the proposal for negative vetting in October 2016. Subject to the negative vetting procedure, the target date for implementation would be end of 2016. THB

¹ http://www.mardep.gov.hk/en/aboutus/pdf/pac_m160107.pdf

(c) *PAC Paper No. 3/2013 – Establishment of Principal Fairways in the Waters North of Lantau Island* and

PAC Paper No. 5/2014 – Proposal on Rearrangement of Principal Fairways and Anchorage in the Western Harbour

8. Mr Warren KP Li, SMO/VTC reported that the Draft Drafting Instructions ('DDIs') to amend the Shipping and Port Control Regulations (Cap. 313A), with a view to - SMO/VTC

(i) setting aside a portion of the navigable waters north of Lantau Island as three connected principal fairways, had been sent to THB; and

(ii) widening the Northern Fairway, North Green Island Fairway and Southern Fairway, were under internal clearance before sending them to THB.

(d) *PAC Paper No. 1/2016 – Revision to Vessel Traffic Services ('VTS') Procedures and Re-delineation of Very High Frequency ('VHF') Sectors*

9. Mr Warren KP Li, SMO/VTC reported that the DDIs to amend the Shipping and Port Control Regulations (Cap. 313A) were under internal clearance. Thereafter, the draft DDIs would be sent to THB for legislative amendment. SMO/VTC

10. Mr Danny Yeung, HKPA commented that there was room for improvement in the very high frequency ('VHF') communication quality of the new VTS system as pilots often needed to ask VTC to speak up via VHF.

11. Mr W. H. Wong, GM/VTS responded that MD was aware of the situation. As indicated by the contractor, it was due to co-existence of the old analogue system and the new digital system. The situation should improve upon completion of VHF sub-system replacement. MD would continue to monitor the matter. GM/VTS

12. Since the DDIs mentioned under items (c) and (d) above would soon be submitted to THB and regular update to PAC would be deemed unnecessary, Mr W. H. Wong, GM/LVS suggested removing the two items from the agenda. The Chairman agreed.

(e) PAC Paper No. 2/2016 – Proposed New Edition of Berthing Guidelines

13. Mr George Tang, MO/Pilotage reported that the updated berthing guidelines (edition on 7 January 2016; without cover page) endorsed in the last PAC meeting had been uploaded to the website of MD on 14 January 2016.²

IV. New Discussion Items

(a) PAC Paper No. 5/2016 – Training, Assessment and Examination Arrangements for Apprentice and Class II Pilots

14. Mr George Tang, MO/Pilotage presented the paper to members. The paper described the proposed training, assessment and examination arrangements for apprentice and Class II pilots.
15. Mr John Wilson, Master Mariner enquired about Continued Proficiency Development Programme (‘CPDP’) for Class I pilots depicted in Annex I³ to this paper (which was endorsed in the PAC meeting held on 18 January 2013), and wished to know the details such as the content and structure of courses, the qualifications of lecturers and assessment methods of CPDP. He also wondered whether Class I pilots were only required to complete one simulation practice in a five-year cycle of CPDP.
16. Mr Wang Chi-cheong, HKPA replied in the affirmative and supplemented that in practice, more than one simulation training was provided to Class I pilots. Mr George Tang, MO/Pilotage agreed.
17. Mr John Wilson, Master Mariner commented that as Class I pilots were potentially more exposed to navigational risks than junior pilots, more transparency on CPDP and the agreement between MD and HKPA on simulation training for Class I pilots would be needed.
18. Mr Danny Yeung, HKPA said that it would be most appropriate to retrieve past meeting papers and minutes on CPDP. Mr George Tang, MO/Pilotage agreed that it was worth discussing whether any refresher training would be incorporated in CPDP. The Chairman suggested members put forth all their views on CPDP at the PAC Working Group (‘PACWG’) meetings in future.

PAC
WG

² <http://www.mardep.gov.hk/en/publication/berthing.html>

³ Retrieval from Appendix to minutes of PAC meeting held on 18 January 2013 at http://www.mardep.gov.hk/en/aboutus/pdf/pac_m130118.pdf

Post-meeting note: Details of CPDP are retrievable from PAC Paper No. 3/2006 ‘Framework for Class I Pilots – CPDP’⁴ which was endorsed at PAC meeting of 2 March 2006.⁵ HKPA then searched in Hong Kong for a competent third party to undertake the development, organisation, coordination and delivery of the CPDP. Subsequently, the PolyU Technology and Consultancy Company Limited (‘PteC’) was selected and the consultancy service agreement was signed between HKPA and PteC.⁶

In addition, as retrieved from past PAC meeting minutes,⁷ there was no statutory requirement on the training for the pilots attaining Class I licence. Having said that, periodical refresher trainings were provided by HKPA to Class I pilots in accordance with the IMO 11 Resolution A960 (i.e. Recommendations on Training and Certification and on Operational Procedures for Maritime Pilots other than Deep-sea Pilots)⁸ to ensure the continued proficiency of pilots and updating of their professional knowledge. A Working Group on Training and Certification for Pilots was formed by MD in 2004 to discuss the standard of competency of each class of pilotage and the continued proficiency for pilots. To this end, a CPDP was formulated in 2006 for Class I pilots. They were required to complete courses on Managerial, Technological, Legal and Bridge Resource Management & Simulation exercises in a five-year cycle. The contents of the programme were subject to continual review and enhancement.

19. Mr Wang Chi-cheong, HKPA pointed out that the discrepancy of the remarks – “all practical vessel training and assessments are set for vessel of next higher class” in Annex I to this paper had been addressed in the last PACWG meeting of 15 April 2016 and requested further discussion.
20. Mr W. H. Wong, GM/VTS responded that since Annex I was extracted from the past PAC meeting minutes which reflected the agreement reached at the time of meeting and was endorsed, it was not appropriate to amend the remarks at liberty. The Chairman suggested that Annex I to this paper might be updated to a new Annex upon further deliberations in PACWG meetings in future.

PAC
WG

⁴ http://www.mardep.gov.hk/en/aboutus/pdf/pacp03_06.pdf

⁵ http://www.mardep.gov.hk/en/aboutus/pdf/pac_m060302.pdf (para. 16 refers).

⁶ http://www.mardep.gov.hk/en/aboutus/pdf/pac_m060929.pdf (para. 9 of the minutes of the PAC meeting held on 29 September 2006 refers).

⁷ http://www.mardep.gov.hk/en/aboutus/pdf/pac_m120518.pdf (para. 30 of the minutes of the PAC meeting held on 18 May 2012 refers).

⁸ <http://www.impahq.org/admin/resources/a960en-1.pdf>

21. As no further query was raised, members endorsed the proposed arrangements for training, assessment and examination of Class II Pilots and the proposed examination syllabuses for Class II Pilots at Annexes III and IV to PAC Paper No. 1/2016.
- (b) *PAC Paper No. 6/2016 – Establishment of Traffic Separation Scheme and Pilot Boarding Stations in Mirs Bay*
22. Mr Warren KP Li, SMO/VTC presented the paper to members. The paper informed members of a proposal to establish a set of Traffic Separation Schemes ('TSS') in Mirs Bay (大鵬灣) to better organise the marine traffic in the area as well as responding to the development of liquefied natural gas ('LNG') terminals in Mirs Bay. Members' comments on the establishment of three pilot boarding stations in Mirs Bay to facilitate the embarkation and disembarkation of pilots were also sought.
23. Mr Ma Kam-fai, HK Liner Shipping Association remarked that Liner pilotage service in Mirs Bay, if implemented, would impose a huge shipping burden on the liner shipping sector. Besides, he appealed to MD to send PAC papers in advance to allow more time for members' consideration. The Chairman responded that Mr Ma would be welcome to collect written comments from his side and let MD know after the meeting.
24. Mr Warren KP Li, SMO/VTC responded that the proposed pilotage service would be for the sake of navigational safety and increasing traffic density in Mirs Bay including that of mega-sized vessels and LNG carriers. Mr Ma Kam-fai, HK Liner Shipping Association responded that he did not mean to compromise navigational safety at all, and doubted that with the implementation of TSS in future with a view to enhancing navigational safety, MD should evaluate whether there would still be a need for pilotage service of all types of vessels in Mirs Bay.
25. Mr W. H. Wong, GM/VTS responded that TSS was a routing system to better organise the marine traffic in Mirs Bay whereas pilotage service was provided by licensed pilots who were experts in the local waters of Hong Kong who also had good knowledge in ship handling, appraising traffic situation and handling of emergency situations. On this basis, MD could not agree that establishment of TSS alone would be sufficient to address all marine safety concerns.

26. Mr W. H. Wong, GM/VTS also suggested that the proposed location of the pilot boarding station off the LNG terminals might need to be adjusted northward. The Chairman suggested that PACWG should follow up to fine-tune the location of this proposed pilot boarding station.
27. Mr Cliff Chow, Hongkong Salvage & Towage enquired whether pilots of the People's Republic of China would provide pilotage service in Mirs Bay. The Chairman assured members that Mirs Bay is part of the waters of Hong Kong.

V. **Any Other Business**

28. With reference to para. 32 of the minutes of the last meeting, Mr Ma Kam-fai, HK Liner Shipping Association informed members that the Liner shipping sector had commissioned BMT Asia Pacific Ltd. to conduct a study on review of air-draught restriction on Tsing Ma Bridge which was underway, and would share the findings with members later.
29. Mr K. F. Chan, Wallem Shipping (HK) Limited asked (i) whether there was any berthing guideline for vessels at Cruise Terminal passing through Victoria Harbour; and (ii) whether the cruise vessels ought to pass round Hong Kong Island or could simply pass through Victoria Harbour.
30. Mr W. H. Wong, GM/VTS responded that MD had not received any application so far. Upon an application, MD would consider whether or not to allow a vessel to pass through Victoria Harbour based on genuine needs of the ship's operation and traffic condition, but not for the sake of navigational convenience. In addition, MD would also consider the potential navigational risk and feasibility of turning the vessel off Tsim Sha Tsui into the Northern Fairway without blocking the Central Fairway. The navigational environment would be improved after legislative amendment on widening the Northern Fairway which was underway (para. 8 above refers). Before such legislative amendment, MD maintained the view that large cruise vessels should not transit Victoria Harbour from east to west.

VI. Date of Next Meeting

31. The meeting adjourned at 4:15 p.m. The date of the next meeting would be announced in due course.
32. The Chairman gave a few valedictory remarks and recorded a vote of thanks to all members for their contribution, and wished members to give support to his successor as well.

The minutes of the meeting were confirmed on 16 January 2017.

Distribution list

Chairman, PAC
Members, PAC
Ms Petty POON
Mr. K. F. CHAN
Mr Jackson LAU
Mr SHIU Kin-fai
Mr WANG Chi-cheong
Mr Jerry LO
Mr Cliff CHOW
SMO/VTC, MD
MO/Pilotage, MD

Committee Unit
Marine Department
Ref: L/M No. (5) in HQ/COM 928/29 (24)