

PILOTAGE ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Ref. : HQ/COM 928/29 (16)

Minutes of the Pilotage Advisory Committee Meeting

Date : 7 February 2005 (Monday)
Place : Conference Room A, 24/F, Harbour Building
Time : 10 a.m.

Present

Chairman:	Mr. R F TUPPER	Deputy Director of Marine
Member:	Capt. LI Kwan-wood	Master Mariner
	Mr. MA Yan-kwong	Representing Containers Terminal Operators
	Mr. KONG Cheuk-kwan	Representing Dockyard Industry
	Mr. Frank LAM	Representing Dry Bulk Cargo Operators
	Mr. WONG Yiu-kwong	Representing HK Liner Shipping Association
	Capt. CHEN Yu-chi	Representing HK Pilots Association
	Capt. LAM Tsan-wa	Representing HK Pilots Association
	<i>(on behalf of Capt. PAU Sai-hung)</i>	
	Mr. YOUNG Yick-sing	Representing HK Shipowners Association
	Mr. CHUI Hing-cheung	Representing Oil Terminal Operators
	Capt. Alan LOYND	Representing Tug Operators
	Mr. LEE Ka-mo	AD/PC, Marine Department
	Mr. BUTT Lee-yuen	GM/VTS(Ag), Marine Department
	Mr. TONG Ho-lok	S/MAI(1), Marine Department
Secretary:	Ms. Shirley HO	ADS/C&G, Marine Department

In Attendance

Capt. AU Che-hung	HK Pilots Association (HKPA)
Mr. SHUM Yum-pui	-ditto-
Mr. Tony LI Tai-fai	MO/Pilotage, Marine Department
Mr. Simon HO	MO/P&D(3), Marine Department

Absent with Apologies

Mr. Terrence SIT	HK General Chamber of Commerce
Capt. Joseph FONSEKA	Master Mariner
Mr. NG Jim-mi, Jimmy	Master Mariner
Mr. Bengt William Claesson	Representing Break Bulk Cargo Operators

OPENING REMARKS

1. The Chairman welcomed all present. He extended particular welcomes to the following members who had been appointed since the last PAC meeting held in October 2004 –
 - (a) Capt. Alan LOYND, representing Tug Operators vice Capt. WU Ka-shun;
 - (b) Capt. CHEN Yu-chi and Capt. PAU Sai-hung, representing licensed pilots vice Capt. SO Ying-kit and Capt. CHAN Shui-hoi; and
 - (c) Mr. BUTT Lee-yuen, GM/VT(S)(Ag) of MD, vice Mr. T C SIN.

2. The Chairman told the meeting that Mr. Bengt CLAEISSON, Capt. Joseph FONSEKA, Mr. Jimmy NG and Mr. Terrence SIT were not able to attend the meeting and had sent apologies for absence.

AGENDA ITEMS

I. Confirmation of Minutes of Last Meeting

3. The minutes of last meeting were confirmed without any amendments.

II. Interviewing of Apprentice Pilot

4. Four applicants, Mr. CHU Wah-sau Summy, Mr. FUNG Ka-wai, Mr. LAM Wai-ming Steven and Mr. WONG Kwong-yeung Peter, who had already passed the necessary medical examination, were asked in separate sessions to brief members of their own background. Having asked the four applicants some relevant questions, members were satisfied with their qualifications and experience and agreed to recommend them to the Pilotage Authority for registration as apprentice pilots.

(Post-meeting notes: With the approval from the Pilotage Authority, Mr. CHU, Mr. FUNG, Mr. LAM and Mr. WONG registered as apprentice pilots on 8 February 2005.)

III. Matters Arising from Previous Minutes

Training and Development Programme for Apprentice Pilots (Para. 3-9, Pages 2-4, minutes of last meeting)

5. The Chairman told members that, in response to paragraphs 8 and 9 of the last minutes, a Working Group on Training and Certification for Pilots was formed and 3 working group meetings chaired by Mr. Jimmy NG had been held since October 2004.
6. As Mr. Jimmy NG was not at the meeting, upon invitation by the Chairman, Mr. Tony LI briefly reported what had been discussed at the last three working group meetings. He told members that minutes of the meetings had been uploaded onto Marine Department website. Members, if interested, were welcomed to visit the PAC web page for a sight of the details of the items discussed at the meetings.
7. The Chairman added that the working group had discussed the “Revised Examination Syllabuses for Class I and Class II Pilots” and a paper, i.e. PAC Paper No. 1/2005, had been prepared and would be presented to members by Mr. TONG Ho-lok later at the meeting.

PAC Paper No. 4/2004 – “Study on Marine Traffic Risk Assessment for Hong Kong Waters (Implementation of Recommended Improvement Measures)” (Para. 16-20, Pages 5-6, minutes of last meeting)

8. The meeting agreed at last PAC meeting that the working group to study the marine risks associated with navigation in the waterway of north Lantau including Ma Wan Fairway should be formed under the Port Operations Committee (POC). As invited by the Chairman, Mr. K M LEE reported that at the POC meeting held on 4 February 2005 he agreed to look into the traffic condition in the related areas, particularly in north Lantau. However, under present circumstances, MD was not able to process the setting up of the working group in the near future. He

expected that the working group would be formed in the second half of the year and would report the progress in future POC and PAC meetings.

9. The Chairman took the opportunity to refer members to a paper on “Ma Wan Channel to Shenzhen Ports Passage” which was tabled at the meeting. He thanked the Hong Kong Pilots Association (HKPA) for providing the piece of information and opined that the views therein were very helpful for the working group to move forward. MD would like to make the working group’s work transparent and open-ended so that views from everybody, e.g. the Liner Shipping Association and other interested parties, could be solicited.

Visit to MD’s Training Centre (Para. 23, Page 7, minutes of last meeting)

10. The Chairman apologized for having to put off the buffet lunch and the visit to the Training Centre. He said that the lunch-cum-visit would be arranged for the next PAC meeting.

IV. Discussion Item

(A) PAC Paper No. 1/2005 – “Revised Examination Syllabuses for Class I and Class II Pilots”

11. Mr. TONG Ho-lok briefed members that the current examination syllabuses for Class I and Class II pilots were considered quite out-of-date. In response to the recommendations made in the IMO Resolution A960, the said examination syllabuses were actively discussed at the second and the third meetings of the Working Group on Training and Certification for Pilots and subsequently endorsed by all working group members. Mr. TONG highlighted the changes made to the two syllabuses and invited members’ comments on the paper.
12. Mr. LEE Ka-mo queried why the practical examination for Class I Pilots consisted of berthing of vessels up to 260m in length only. He said that Class I pilots were supposed to be able to pilot vessels over 260m in length and their ability to pilot vessels in such length should therefore be examined before their upgrading to

Class I. Moreover, number of vessels over this length grew fast in these years. Mr. MA Yan-kwong shared Mr. LEE's views.

13. Capt. CHEN Yu-chi and Capt. LAM Tsan-wa explained that the HKPA had its internal practices to restrict the pilots in piloting vessels over 260m in length in accordance to their experience. The Chairman opined that it would be reasonable to consider it in more depth and would not recommend an acceptance at the moment. He suggested putting it back to the working group for more discussion and deliberation. Members agreed and requested the Working Group to follow up the matter.

V. Any Other Business

(a) **Information Note of Consultancy on the Development of an Underkeel Clearance System**

14. An Information Note of Consultancy on the Development of an Underkeel Clearance System was tabled at the meeting. Mr. Simon HO gave a brief presentation to the members. He told members that the study was scheduled to be completed by end of April 2005 and on compilation of the draft final report, the consultant would be asked to present the findings at the PAC.
15. Upon enquiry from Mr. Y P SHUM, the Chairman clarified that the technology at this moment did not seem to be sufficiently reliable for a dynamic system. He said that a dynamic system would be something MD would go towards, if he was able to be convinced by the consultant that indeed such a system of dynamic predictability did exist with a high degree of reliability. Therefore, it would very much depend on the findings of the study and the recommendations from the consultant for the next step forward.
16. Mr. Frank LAM requested that the 2nd phase of the study should also cover a recommendation of an UKC system for bulk carriers. The Chairman replied that the consultant would be asked to include the dry bulker cargo operators in phase II of the consultancy study.

17. Capt. LAM Tsan-wa doubted if the findings of the consultancy study would be comprehensive enough because the study was carried out in three months only but not a year covering different seasons and climate. Mr. Simon HO explained that climatological information would be collected from the Hong Kong Observatory to help make the study as comprehensive as possible. The Chairman added that MD would look at the feasibility and make adjustments to the findings if and when required.
18. The Chairman said that the consultant would board large containerhips to collect the technical data while the ships were maneuvering in and out of the container port in the following few weeks and thanked in advance for the cooperation by the related stakeholders.

(b) Trial Run of Provisional Berthing Guideline for Ma Wan Transit

19. An information note on the trial run of the Provisional Berthing Guidelines for Ma Wan Transit was tabled at the meeting for members' reference. Capt. LAM Tsan-wa briefed members that the trial run started some time in November 2004 and was generally found comfortable and feasible. However, for safety sake, a further study and risk assessment would be essential before any trial run for bringing in larger vessels, say beyond 335m LOA.

(c) Report of Board of Discipline (BOD) Cases

20. The Chairman told the meeting that four BODs had been arranged since last PAC meeting held on 4.10.2004. He thanked ex-member Capt. SO Ying-kit and Capt. WU Ka-shun, members Capt. LI Kwan-wood, Capt. Joseph FONSEKA, Capt. CHEN Yu-chi and Mr. Jimmy NG for giving their time and expertise while serving on the Boards.

(d) Change of PAC Membership

21. The Chairman said that except the two newly appointed licensed pilots, i.e. Capt.

CHEN Yu-chi and Capt. PAU Sai-hung, membership of all of the other members would expire on 28.2.2005. He thanked all members for having served on the PAC in their term of office.

(e) Adjustment to Tariff

22. Mr. Y P SHUM explained that 10 additional new pilots were employed to meet the need arising from the rapid increase of pilotage services to west Shenzhen. The HKPA had been discussing the matter with the Liner Shipping Association since March 2004 and asked for a reasonable adjustment to the tariff. However, the negotiation was not going very well. He would like to make a note that, if they got into any problem with the discussion, it might be put onto the table of the PAC and views from members might be required. He also requested a circulation of the proposed adjustment to seek members' endorsement if a mutual agreement could be reached but a PAC meeting could not be held in short notice.
23. The Chairman expressed his understanding and said that he would prefer to convene a PAC meeting to discuss the issue if and when necessary. However, he had no objection to the proposed circulation if urgent comments from members were required. He emphasized that, if the members did have comments on the adjustment, he would convene a PAC meeting even at a short notice to address the issue and ensure that every interested party would be consulted sufficiently.

VI. Date of Next Meeting

24. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 12 noon. The date of next meeting would be announced in due course.

(Post-meeting notes: The next meeting was scheduled for 10 a.m. on 30 June 2005.)